Dr. Jennifer Gibbs

Co-Editor-in-Chief, *Communication Research*

Dear Jennifer Gibbs,

We would like our paper, entitled as “*In Validations We Trust? The Impact of Imperfect Human Annotations as a Gold Standard on the Quality of Validation of Automated Content Analysis*,” to be considered for publication in *Communication Research*.

Focusing on the typical practices of validation involving human-coded materials in automated content analysis applications, this study ﬁrst presents a systematic review of articles published in major social science journals in the past 20 years. The results show that the current practices of validation utilizing manual annotations are far from being acknowledged in the literature, and that the reporting and interpretation of validation procedures differ greatly. In a second step, we assess the connection between the quality of human judgment in manual annotations and relative performance evaluations of automated procedures (against true standards) by relying on large-scale, systematic Monte-Carlo simulations. Results from the simulations conﬁrm the expectation that there is a greater risk of a researcher to reach an incorrect conclusion regarding the performances of automated procedures when the quality of manual annotations used in validation is not properly ensured.

To our knowledge, this contribution is among the very first to provide thorough, systematic evidence pertaining to a well-known, yet extremely scarcely discussed topic. Our contribution should be read as a call for a systematic application of high-quality human coding for validation procedures in automated content analysis approaches, and we believe this would be a great interest for the general readership of CR.

This manuscript represents an original contribution and is not being considered elsewhere for publication.

Warm regards,

In behalf of authors,

Dr. Hyunjin Song

Department of Communication

University of Vienna

Rathausstraße 19/9

1010 Vienna, Austria

[hyunjin.song@univie.ac.at](mailto:hyunjin.song@univie.ac.at)